**The disproportionate case-fatality ratio of COVID-19 between top vaccinated countries and the rest of the world**

Najmul Haider 1†±, Mohammad Nayeem Hasan 2†, Javier Guitian 1, Rumi A Khan 3, David McCoy 4, Francine Ntoumi 5,6, Osman Dar 7, Rashid Ansumana 8, Md. Jamal Uddin 2,11\*, Alimuddin Zumla 9,10,Richard A Kock 1

**Affiliations:**

1 The Royal Veterinary College, University of London, Hawkshead Lane, North Mymms, Hatfield, Hertfordshire, United Kingdom

2 Department of Statistics, Shahjalal University of Science and Technology, Sylhet 3114, Bangladesh.

3 Division of Pulmonary Critical Care Medicine, Dell Medical School at University of Texas Austin, Texas, USA

4 Institute of Population Health Sciences, Barts and London Medical and Dental School, Queen Mary University of London, London, UK

5 Congolese Foundation for Medical Research, Brazzaville, Republic of Congo.

6 Institute for Tropical Medicine, University of Tübingen, Tübingen, Germany

7 Chatham House Centre for Global Health Security, Royal Institute of International Affairs, London, UK

8 School of Community Health Science, Njala University, Bo Campus, Sierra Leone

9 Division of Infection and Immunity, Centre for Clinical Microbiology, University College London, 10 NIHR-BRC, University College London Hospitals, London, United Kingdom.

11 Department of General Educational and Development, Daffodil International University, Dhaka, Bangladesh

**Keywords:** COVID-19, SARS-CoV-2, Case-fatality ratio, Vaccine equity, Variants of Concern (VOC)

† These authors contributed equally

± Current address: School of Life Sciences, Keele university, Staffordshire, United Kingdom

\*Corresponding author

Corresponding author address:

Department of Statistics,

Shahjalal University of Science and Technology,

Sylhet 3114, Bangladesh.

E-mail: jamal-sta@sust.edu

**Abstract**

**Objectives:**

We compared the global reported cumulative case-fatality ratio (rCFR) and excess mortality between top-20 countries with COVID-19 vaccination rates, the rest of the world and Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) before and after commencement of vaccination programmes.

**Methods:**

We performed time series model to understand the trend of CFR over time and performed generalized linear mixed model to understand role of vaccination on CFR.

**Results:**

By 31 December 2022, on average 250.2 doses of COVID-19 vaccines per 100 people had been administered in the top-20 vaccinated countries, compared to 194.8 doses in the rest of the world, and 51.2 in SSA. The mean rCFR of COVID-19 had dropped by 69.0% in the top in the top-20 vaccinated countries, 26.50% in the rest of the world and 7.6% in SSA. The excess mortality had dropped by 48.7% in top vaccinated countries compared to 62.5% in the rest of the world and 60.7% in SSA. In a generalized linear mixed model, reported number of vaccine doses administered doses (/100 population) (Odds ratio: 0.64) was associated with a steeper reduction of the country’s COVID-19 rCFR.

**Suggestion:**

Vaccine equity and faster roll-out across the world is critically important in reducing COVID-19 transmission and CFR.

**Introduction:**

In the early stages of the COVID-19 pandemic, the WHO-China Joint Mission on Coronavirus Diseases (COVID-19) 28 February 2020 report indicated a crude Case fatality ratio (CFR) of 3.8% among the first 55,924 laboratory-confirmed cases (WHO 2020b). Subsequently, systematic reviews on the case-fatality ratio (CFR) of COVID-19 reported an estimated CFR between 2.3-3.6% (Epidemiology Working Group for NCIP Epidemic Response Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention 2020; Fu et al. 2020; He et al. 2020; Ahammed et al. 2021). The global cumulative reported case fatality ratio (rCFR) of COVID-19 increased up until the 17th epidemiological week (April 22–28, 2020) following detection of SARS-CoV-2 in Wuhan China at 7.2, and then started to decline steadily up until 31 December 2021 at 2.2 (Hasan et al. 2021).

Vaccination can reduce the CFR of COVID-19. Several vaccines have been approved for emergency use by the Food and Drug Administration, USA, the European Medicine Agency and the United Kingdom Health Security Agency. The World Health Organization (WHO) also approved use of a few Vaccines across the world. It has been estimated that vaccines prevent infection by 60-92% (Dagan et al. 2021; Lopez Bernal et al. 2021), hospitalizations by 87-94% (Dagan et al. 2021; Vasileiou et al. 2021) and deaths by 72%- 100%(Dagan et al. 2021; Murillo-Zamora et al. 2021) after 7-28 days of receiving the second dose of the vaccines for Alpha, Beta, or Delta VOC.

COVID-19 Vaccines are not distributed equitably in the world (Watson et al. 2022). Although COVID-19 vaccines were developed at an unprecedented rate through the advancement of science and global cooperation, the distribution of the vaccine across the world is questionable (Katz et al. 2021). Current global vaccination rates is roughly 6.7 million doses per day and the vaccine distribution is absent or very limited in many low-income countries. Experts anticipated that 80% of the population in low-income countries would not receive a vaccine at the end of 2021 (Katz et al. 2021), which has been the case.

As the world faces the 3rd year of the COVID-19 pandemic, globally, as of 31 December 2022, there have been over 660.35 million confirmed cases of COVID-19, including 6.69 million deaths, reported to WHO (Worldometer 2020). COVID-19 vaccination rollout globally has progressed at varying rates and the impact of mass vaccination on case fatality ratio should be explored and inform global access to vaccine. To this end, we compared the global rCFR between the top-20 countries in terms of vaccination rates (minimum vaccination: 250.23 dose/100 people), sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), and the rest of the world, before and after commencement of vaccination programs. We further explored the association between vaccination and other control measures on Covid-19 CFR and excess mortality.

**Methods:**

**COVID-19 data**

The necessary COVID-19 related data, including daily reported new cases, daily reported new deaths, reported total deaths, reported total deaths per million inhabitants and vaccination (number of doses of any COVID-19 vaccine administered/100 people), were collected from the WHO daily COVID-19 situation reports of 210 countries from Jan 01, 2020, to December 31, 2022 (WHO 2022a). On 8th December 2020, the first human in the world received an approved COVID-19 vaccine (BBC News 2020). We considered the 28th day of receiving the first vaccine in the world as a cut-off to compare the pre-vaccine period (Jan 1, 2020 – Jan 5, 2021) and the post-vaccine period (Jan 6, 2021- December 31, 2022). Altogether, we had data from 159 countries for analysis after excluding countries with population size less than 1 M. We also included the following 44 SSA countries: Angola, Benin, Botswana, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad, Democratic Republic of Congo, Congo, Cote d'Ivoire, Djibouti, Equatorial Guinea, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Gabon, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Kenya, Lesotho, Liberia, Madagascar, Malawi, Mali, Mauritania, Mauritius, Mozambique, Namibia, Niger, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Somalia, South Africa, South Sudan, Sudan, Tanzania, Togo, Uganda, Zambia, and Zimbabwe.

**Identifying top-20 vaccinated countries.**

We considered top-20 countries that consistently remained on top of weekly vaccination rate (/100 population) during the period 5 Jan 2021- 31 December 2022. We utilized a count variable to identify the top-20 vaccinated countries each week, which adds a score of one if a country is listed in the top-20 countries in a week and zero otherwise. We repeated the procedure for each week until 31 August 2022. Finally, we selected top-20 countries with higher aggregated score for weekly vaccination rate. The top-20 countries by COVID-19 vaccination rate were Bahrain, Belgium, Cambodia, Canada, Chile, China, Cuba, Denmark, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Portugal, Qatar, Singapore, South Korea, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom, Uruguay.

**Reported case-fatality ratio (rCFR)**

We calculated daily cumulative rCFR COVID-19 as we have described in our earlier paper Hasan et al (Hasan et al. 2021) as the number of reported COVID-19 attributed deaths per 100 COVID-19 confirmed cases expressed as rCFR = (weekly reported COVID-19 attributed deaths/weekly reported COVID-19 confirmed cases)x100. As the number of cases and deaths both are a fraction of total cases or deaths globally, we considered the term as reported-CFR (or to make a simplified version as rCFR (Hasan et al. 2021)).

**Excess mortality**

Excess mortality is used to describe the number of deaths from all causes during a particular period that is higher than expected under "normal" circumstances (Checchi and Roberts 2005).The excess mortality was calculated as the difference between the recorded number of fatalities in a certain week or month (depending on the country) between Jan 2021 and December 2022 and an estimate of the projected deaths for that time period if the COVID-19 pandemic had not happened (Roser et al. 2020; WHO 2022b). There are great difficulties associated with obtaining excess mortality data from many countries, however, ‘Our World In Data’ tracked data from different sources and we could extract excess mortality data from 159 countries for the period of 5 Jan 2021 to 31 December 2022 (OWID 2022).

**Time series model to predict the trend**

Three time-series models (i.e., auto-regressive integrated moving average (ARIMA), automatic time-series forecasting model also known as ‘Prophet model’, and simple exponential smoothing (SES)), were used to identify the global trend of COVID-19 rCFR and excess mortality. The details of the SES, ARIMA, and Prophet models are discussed in an earlier article on COVID-19 (Hasan et al. 2021).

**Outcome and predictor variables**

We collected data on selected predictors variables from the World Bank or other UN sources and from “Our World in Data” including population density (World Data Bank 2018), percentage of people above 65 years of age (The World Bank 2018b), Gross Domestic Product (GDP)(The World Bank 2018a), worldwide governance indicators (WGI)(The World Bank 2019), and Global Health Security Index (GHSI) (Nuclear Threat Initiative (NTI) and Johns Hopkins Center for Health Security (JHU) 2020), the prevalence of obesity (WHO 2020a; Data 2021) for our analyses. We also included the country-specific prevalence of diabetes (Data 2021) and cardiovascular disease (Data 2021) to explain the variation of COVID-19 rCFR. We used Stringency Index (SI) from the Oxford COVID-19 Government Response Tracker. (Oxford COVID-19 Government Response Tracker 2020).

**Empirical evaluation**

We assessed the ARIMA and Prophet models by comparing their results to benchmarks model, the SES (Kourentzes and Petropoulos 2016). The SES also allows the most appropriate non-seasonal model for each series, allowing for any kind of error or trend component. We, then, analysed and compared the performance of the time series models with some of the commonly used measures to evaluate the prediction significance including coefficient of determination (*R2*), root mean square error (RMSE), and mean absolute error (MAE).

**Generalized Linear Mixed Models**

We developed a generalized linear mixed model (GLMM) with beta distribution to identify whether the explanatory variables have any relationship with the country’s rCFR of COVID-19 and excess mortality. The GLMM is an extension of the Generalized Linear Models (GLM) that allows the analysis of clustered categorical data, as in the case of repeated responses from different subjects (Samur et al. 2014). One of the key advantages of GLMM is that it separates the levels of the models to account for the group effect nesting the lower-level observations. In this study, we have several observations within the variable ‘locations (country or territory)’. While the location data are assumed to be time-invariant, the independent data are assumed to be universal over the whole study area at a certain time point. The model describes a beta distribution family that has a logit link.

Although we have selected variables carefully and kept consistency with our previous publications on the subject (Hasan et al. 2021), we were not able to add some potential confounding variables including the median age of cases in each country. All analyses were carried out using the statistical software R version 3.5.2.2 (R Core Team (2020)).

**Statistical analysis**

We performed summary statistics of vaccine doses/100 inhabitant and rCFR by country in the top-20 countries in terms of vaccination rate **(Fig. 1)**, in SSA, and in the rest of the world pre-and post-vaccination programme and reported the mean and standard error (SE). We observed that the rCFR and excess mortality of COVID-19 has changed over time (**Fig. 2**). Using time-series models alone would not allow us to identify the reason behind the increasing and decreasing trend of COVID-19 rCFR/excess mortality.

**RESULTS:**

More than 660.35 million cumulative confirmed COVID-19 cases and 6.69 million COVID-19 related deaths had been documented globally by 31 December 2022. More than 165.40 doses of COVID-19 vaccines have been given per 100 population on average globally as of 31 December 2022. For every 100 people, 250.23 doses of vaccines have been given in the top-20 COVID-19 vaccination countries. In the rest of the world (including SSA), 194.84 doses of COVID-19 vaccines have been given, whereas the number is just 51.21 in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) **(Table 1)**. The rCFR is estimated as 1.89 in the top-vaccinated countries on 5 Jan 2021, which has dropped by 69.31% at 0.58 on 31 December 2022. In the rest of the world, the rCFR dropped from 2.34 on 5 Jan 2021 to 1.72 on 31 December 2022, which represents a reduction of only 26.50% (**Table 1**). In SSA, the rCFR has decreased by 7.61% over the period (1.97 vs. 1.82). Between 5 Jan 2021 and 31 December 2022, the excess mortality had dropped by 48.65% in top vaccinated countries compared to 62.50% in the rest of the world and 60.71% in SSA (**Table 1**). The correlation coefficient between vaccination rate (/100 people) and rCFR in different countries of the world on 31 December 2022 is estimated as -0.363 (p<0.001) and with excess mortality as -0.321 (p<0.001) **(Fig 3)**.

**Factors associated with rCFR and excess mortality:**

In the GLMM, the estimated effect of each variable is presented as odds ratio (OR). The reported number of vaccine doses administered (/100 population) (0.64 [0.62–0.65]) and (0.96 [0.95–0.98]), GDP (0.79 [0.68–0.91]) and (0.92 [0.89–0.97]), and stringency index (0.88 [0.87–0.89]) and (1.13 [1.12–1.14]) were negatively significantly associated with the COVID-19 rCFR and excess mortality, respectively (**Table 2**).

Table 2 includes various covariates and the random intercept in the model. The intraclass correlation coefficient (ICC) of 0.682 was calculated by dividing the variance of the random effect by the total variance. Thus, the spatial unit effects account for approximately 68.2% of the total variance of weekly rCFR, which suggests moderate reliability on location effects on weekly rCFR. It is also to be noted that with the introduction of a random intercept, “vaccination”, “population density”, “GDP”, “weeks” and “stringency index” had significant negative effects on weekly rCFR and “the percentage of people aged 65 and above” have significant positive effects.

**The Trend of global rCFR of COVID-19:**

In the ARIMA and Prophet models, we found a strong declining trend of rCFR of COVID-19 between observed and predictive global rCFR of COVID-19 with an *R2*, RMSE, and MAE value of 99.97% and 99.50%, 0.029 and 0.113, and 0.008 and 0.059, respectively (**Table 3**). The observed and predicted rCFR and observed and predicted excess mortality had a fair agreement **(Fig 4)**.

In terms of accuracy, the ARIMA model performed better over Prophet and SES model (with better *R2*, RMSE, and MAE value). The coefficient of determination of the ARIMA model was larger and errors are lower than in the Prophet and SES models. According to the forecast in both models, the ratio of COVID-19 rCFR is expected to decrease considerably in the coming 10 days (**Fig 1).**

**Discussion:**

The global rCFR of COVID-19 has been declining since May 2020, stabilizing or increasing slightly with the emergence of different variants of concern, particularly Delta VOC (Zhao et al. 2022). Following the rollout of COVID-19 vaccines, the rCFR started to decline, although, at a different rate in top-20 vaccination rate countries (69% drop), and the rest of the world (27% drop). In SSA, where the vaccine rollout has not yet reached a satisfactory mark, the rCFR of COVID- 19 remained roughly unchanged (dropped by 8%). The excess mortality, on the other hand, dropped by 49% in top-vaccinated countries, 62.5% in the rest of the world and 60.71% for Sub-Saharan Africa. Many factors affect the reduction of rCFR, however, our results are compatible with vaccination and stringency of control measures contributing to the reduction of rCFR. A study on global impact of COVID-19 vaccination showed that the vaccination averted 14.4 million reported deaths (or 19.8 million excess deaths) due to COVID-19 in the first year of vaccination (8 Dec 2020-8 Dec 2021) (Watson et al. 2022). This analysis complements previous findings showing a disproportionate decline of rCFR and excess mortality in countries with various vaccination coverage indicating the importance of equitable distribution of COVID-19 vaccine.

We found an overall decreasing trend of excess mortality post vaccination period. In contrast to the negligible decline of the rCFR, SSA countries experienced a marked drop of the excess mortality. Excess mortality during this pandemic was affected by different factors, and not merely by transmission of COVID-19 and vaccination coverage. Some of these factors (e.g. shielding the elderly people) may have even contributed to reduction in excess mortality. The differential impact of these factors made the use of excess mortality an unpredictable estimator of COVID-19 severity (Kelly et al. 2021). We did not compare the excess mortality data at country level. Although differences in data and methodology preclude direct comparisons between our results and those of the above studies, it should be noted that none of the top ranked countries according to excess mortality are from SSA. Although increasing vaccination where possible is beneficial, it may not the only reason why the mortality rate in SSA, where the majority of the population is under 65 years, has dropped markedly since 2021. It is known that survival from COVID-19 infection is higher in younger age groups (Kremer and Thurner 2020; Hasan et al. 2021)

The negative correlation between doses of COVID-19 vaccines given per hundred populations, rCFR and excess mortality indicate the benefit of vaccines. Thus, the vaccine has been considered as a pathway out of this pandemic, but strong, innovative policies that ensure fast and equitable distribution are absent (Katz et al. 2021; Watson et al. 2022). Vaccinating the world serves global interests of protecting each other’s health, and economy (Katz et al. 2021). Our analysis showed a great disparity in vaccine roll out between top vaccinated counties (250 doses/100 people) and low-income countries (e.g. 51 doses/100 people in SSA) by 31 December 2022. In high-income countries, the administration of a third or even fourth COVID-19 vaccine dose is ongoing (Iacobucci 2022) whereas more than 60% of the population in SSA have not yet received a single dose of vaccine (as of 31 December 2022).

We found COVID-19 vaccination, stringency index, and GDP as significantly associated with the reduction of rCFR of COVID-19. The major vaccines (mRNA, or adenovirus vectored) have all been found to be highly effective in reducing hospital admission and death, even though some of the vaccines were not very effective in limiting the infection (Altarawneh et al. 2022). Thus, the vaccine rollout helped high-income countries quickly reduce the burden of patients in hospitals limiting COVID-19 fatalities. However, in the rest of the world where vaccine rollout is still far from reaching a satisfactory level (70-85% of people receiving full doses of vaccines) (Katz et al. 2021), the case-fatality ratio has not declined markedly in comparison to the top vaccinated countries. On the other hand, the results from different surveys suggest that in many SSA countries, the natural immunity had reached a state where it is limiting spread and reducing the overall burden of the pandemic (Mukwege et al. 2021). In the Republic of Congo 66% of people in Brazzaville (Ingoba and Ntoumi 2021) in Malawi, 64.9% of blood donors (Mandolo et al. 2021) and in the Central African Republic, 74% of community residents have been found to have antibodies to SARS-CoV-2 (Alexandre et al. 2021). The country’s GDP is another indicator associated with the reduction of COVID-19 rCFR. Countries with higher national income deployed vaccines at a faster rate, which reduced the local transmission and rate of hospitalization, allowing them to concentrate on the vulnerable population, all synergistically helped them reduce the fatalities due to COVID-19. Earlier studies have also identified these variables as a risk factors for mortality/fatality ratio of COVID-19 (Haider et al. 2020c; Hasan et al. 2021; Kim et al. 2021).

Equitable distribution of SARS-CoV-2 vaccines is crucial to ending the COVID-19 pandemic (Michie et al. 2021; Watson et al. 2022). The circulation of SARS-CoV-2 across the world among the large unvaccinated populations might allow the virus to reassort and become a new VOC. Furthermore, many animal species are susceptible to SARS-CoV-2 including mink, primates, rodents, cats, and dogs (Haider et al. 2020b). Several animal species have been linked with emergence of SARS-CoV-2 VOC including dogs for Alpha variant (Zhang et al. 2021) and rodents for Omicron variant (Wei et al. 2021). Thus, this is important to reduce the circulation of SARS-CoV-2 in the human and animal populations to avoid further epidemics caused by emergence of new VOC. Equitable and faster vaccine rollout is the key to reducing the circulation of SARS-CoV-2 across the world (Watson et al. 2022).

We have adjusted the model with number of test/100 population in each country. Some countries do not report the daily testing number while some countries share test number irregularly. Testing is an important variable that if not adjusted for it might result in the identification of spurious relationships. The denominator of the rCFR, the cases of COVID-19 is entirely predicated on the number of tests that a country has reported. As such, it is possible that the lower rCFRs in higher vaccination countries is simply reflective of greater testing capacity and thus a bigger denominator for the same number of deaths. Thus, only those countries that regularly reported test data were kept in the analysis.

This study has several limitations. The main limitation is the dependence of number of cases on the intensity of testing thus countries with under testing had missed the fatal cases due to COVID-19. In countries where people undergo swabs for travelling, working, moving, accessing to healthcare etc., which tend to be higher income countries where vaccine roll out was faster, large numbers of asymptomatic people are tested daily, which may result in the identification of large numbers of asymptomatic infections. These are then counted as COVID cases but are merely clinically ill. Thus, only some individuals in these countries actually are cases, because a large fraction of positives is asymptomatic and are, therefore, infected. This might cause an expansion in the denominator of the proportion artificially lowering the case fatality ratio. In contrast, it is likely that in Saharan African countries the proportion of apparently healthy individuals who are tested is much lower leading to apparently lower rCFR in these countries. The associations we reported between COVID-19 rCFR/excess mortality and explanatory variables are statistical associations and should not be interpreted as causal.

**Conclusion:**

More than 250 doses of COVID-19 vaccines have been given per 100 people in the top-20 countries with higher vaccination rates, compared to 195 doses in the rest of the world and 51 doses in Sub-Saharan Africa as of 31 December 2022. Vaccination is negatively correlated with reported CFR (r=-0.36) and with excess mortality (r= -0.32) which is likely to reflect a contribution of vaccines to the reduction of COVID-19 related deaths. The excess mortality and COVID-19 rCFR continued to decline since February 2021, although at a disproportionate rate between top vaccinated countries and the rest of the world. However, the rCFR has dropped dramatically (69.3%) in the group of 20 countries with highest vaccination rates (70%), quite markedly in the world (30.0%), whereas only 7.6% in in Sub-Saharan Africa. The COVID-19 vaccination, Stringency Index, and country’s GDP were associated with reduction of rCFR of COVID-19. Vaccine equity and faster roll-out across the world is critically important in reducing COVID-19 transmission and CFR.

**References:**

Ahammed T, Anjum A, Rahman MM, Haider N, Kock R, Uddin MJ. Estimation of novel coronavirus (COVID‐19) reproduction number and case fatality rate: A systematic review and meta‐analysis. Heal Sci Reports [Internet]. 2021 Jun 3;4(2):1–11. Available from: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/hsr2.274

Alexandre M, Christian M, Brice MY, Henri SCD, Dieu LJ de J, Darnycka BMR, et al. Very high relative seroprevalence of anti-SARS-CoV-2 antibodies among communities in Bangui, Central African Republic. medXiv. 2021;Nov 21:Available at: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.11.18.2.

Altarawneh H, Chemaitelly H, Tang P, R MH, Abu-Raddad LJ. Protection afforded by prior infection against SARS-CoV-2 reinfection with the Omicron variant. medrXiv. 2022;https://do.

BBC News. No TitleCovid-19 vaccine: First person receives Pfizer jab in UK. BBC. 2020;Available at: https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-552273.

Brüssow H. COVID‐19: Omicron – the latest, the least virulent, but probably not the last variant of concern of SARS‐CoV‐2. Microb Biotechnol [Internet]. 2022 Apr 20; Available from: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/1751-7915.14064

Checchi F, Roberts L. Interpreting and using mortality data in humanitarian emergencies - Humanitarian Practice Network. Interpreting and using mortality data in humanitarian emergencies. 2005.

Dagan N, Barda N, Kepten E, Miron O, Perchik S, Katz MA, et al. BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 Vaccine in a Nationwide Mass Vaccination Setting. N Engl J Med [Internet]. 2021;384(15):1412–23. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/33626250

Data OW in. COVID-19: Stringency Index, Oct 2, 2021. 2021.

Dechsupa S, Assawakosri S, Phakham S, Honsawek S. Positive impact of lockdown on COVID-19 outbreak in Thailand. Travel Med Infect Dis [Internet]. 2020 Jul;36:101802. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S1477893920302982

Epidemiology Working Group for NCIP Epidemic Response Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention. The epidemiological characteristics of an outbreak of 2019 novel coronavirus diseases (COVID-19) in China. Zhonghua Liu Xing Bing Xue Za Zhi. 2020 Feb;41(2):145–51.

Fu L, Wang B, Yuan T, Chen X, Ao Y, Fitzpatrick T, et al. Clinical characteristics of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in China: A systematic review and meta-analysis. J Infect [Internet]. 2020 Jun;80(6):656–65. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0163445320301705

Haider N, Osman AY, Gadzekpo A, Akipede GO, Asogun D, Ansumana R, et al. Lockdown measures in response to COVID-19 in nine sub-Saharan African countries. BMJ Glob Heal [Internet]. 2020a Oct 7;5(10):e003319. Available from: https://gh.bmj.com/lookup/doi/10.1136/bmjgh-2020-003319

Haider N, Rothman-Ostrow P, Osman AY, Arruda LB, Macfarlane-Berry L, Elton L, et al. COVID-19—Zoonosis or Emerging Infectious Disease? Front Public Heal [Internet]. 2020b Nov 26;8(November):1–8. Available from: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpubh.2020.596944/full

Haider N, Yavlinsky A, Chang YM, Hasan MN, Benfield C, Osman AY, et al. The Global Health Security index and Joint External Evaluation score for health preparedness are not correlated with countries’ COVID-19 detection response time and mortality outcome. Epidemiol Infect [Internet]. 2020c Sep 7;148:e210. Available from: https://www.cambridge.org/core/product/identifier/S0950268820002046/type/journal\_article

Hasan MN, Haider N, Stigler FL, Khan RA, McCoy D, Zumla A, et al. The Global Case-Fatality Rate of COVID-19 Has Been Declining Since May 2020. Am J Trop Med Hyg [Internet]. 2021 Apr 21;104(6):2176–84. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/33882025

He W, Yi GY, Zhu Y. Estimation of the basic reproduction number, average incubation time, asymptomatic infection rate, and case fatality rate for COVID-19: Meta-analysis and sensitivity analysis. J Med Virol. 2020 May;

Iacobucci G. Covid-19: Fourth vaccine doses—who needs them and why? BMJ [Internet]. 2022 Jan 7;o30. Available from: https://www.bmj.com/lookup/doi/10.1136/bmj.o30

Ingoba LL, Ntoumi F. Seroprevalence of SARS-CoV-2 among residents of Brazzaville, the Republic of Congo. In: EDCTP Forum. Maputo, Mozambique; 2021.

Jassat W, Karim SA, Mudara C, Welch R, Ozougwu L, Groome M, et al. Clinical Severity of COVID-19 Patients Admitted to Hospitals in Gauteng, South Africa During the Omicron-Dominant Fourth Wave. SSRN Electron J [Internet]. 2021; Available from: https://www.ssrn.com/abstract=3996320

Karlinsky A, Kobak D. Tracking excess mortality across countries during the covid-19 pandemic with the world mortality dataset. Elife. 2021 Jun;10.

Katz IT, Weintraub R, Bekker LG, Brandt AM. From Vaccine Nationalism to Vaccine Equity — Finding a Path Forward. N Engl J Med [Internet]. 2021 Apr 8;384(14):1281–3. Available from: http://www.nejm.org/doi/10.1056/NEJMp2103614

Kelly G, Petti S, Noah N. Covid-19, non-Covid-19 and excess mortality rates not comparable across countries. Epidemiol Infect. 2021;149.

Kim J, Hong K, Yum S, Gómez Gómez RE, Jang J, Park SH, et al. Factors associated with the difference between the incidence and case-fatality ratio of coronavirus disease 2019 by country. Sci Rep [Internet]. 2021;11(1):18938. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/34556739

Kourentzes N, Petropoulos F. Forecasting with multivariate temporal aggregation: The case of promotional modelling. Int J Prod Econ. 2016 Nov;181:145–53.

Kremer HJ, Thurner W. Age Dependence in COVID-19 Mortality in Germany. Dtsch Arztebl Int [Internet]. 2020 Jun 19; Available from: https://www.aerzteblatt.de/10.3238/arztebl.2020.0432

Lau H, Khosrawipour V, Kocbach P, Mikolajczyk A, Schubert J, Bania J, et al. The positive impact of lockdown in Wuhan on containing the COVID-19 outbreak in China. J Travel Med [Internet]. 2020 May 18;27(3). Available from: https://academic.oup.com/jtm/article/doi/10.1093/jtm/taaa037/5808003

Liang LL, Tseng CH, Ho HJ, Wu CY. Covid-19 mortality is negatively associated with test number and government effectiveness. Sci Rep [Internet]. 2020 Dec 24;10(1):12567. Available from: http://www.nature.com/articles/s41598-020-68862-x

Lopez Bernal J, Andrews N, Gower C, Robertson C, Stowe J, Tessier E, et al. Effectiveness of the Pfizer-BioNTech and Oxford-AstraZeneca vaccines on covid-19 related symptoms, hospital admissions, and mortality in older adults in England: test negative case-control study. BMJ [Internet]. 2021 May 13;n1088. Available from: https://www.bmj.com/lookup/doi/10.1136/bmj.n1088

Madhi SA, Kwatra G, Myers JE, Jassat W, Dhar N, Mukendi CK, et al. Population Immunity and Covid-19 Severity with Omicron Variant in South Africa. N Engl J Med [Internet]. 2022 Apr 7;386(14):1314–26. Available from: http://www.nejm.org/doi/10.1056/NEJMoa2119658

Mahase E. Covid-19: Death rate is 0.66% and increases with age, study estimates. The BMJ. 2020.

Mahase E. Covid-19: How many variants are there, and what do we know about them?: Video 1. BMJ [Internet]. 2021 Aug 19;374:n1971. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n1971

Mandolo J, Msefula J, Henrion MYR, Brown C, Moyo B, Samon A, et al. SARS-CoV-2 exposure in Malawian blood donors: an analysis of seroprevalence and variant dynamics between January 2020 and July 2021. BMC Med [Internet]. 2021 Dec 19;19(1):303. Available from: https://bmcmedicine.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s12916-021-02187-y

Martínez-Valero C, Miranda JD, Martín-Sánchez FJ. The impact of time to impose lockdown on COVID-19 cases and deaths in European countries. Med Clínica (English Ed [Internet]. 2020 Nov;155(10):459–60. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S238702062030499X

Michie S, Bullen C, Lazarus J V., Lavis JN, Thwaites J, Smith L, et al. Vaccine Equity Is Crucial to End the COVID-19 Pandemic — But It Won’t Be Enough. 2021.

Mukwege D, Byabene AK, Akonkwa EM, Dahma H, Dauby N, Cikwanine Buhendwa JP, et al. High SARS-CoV-2 Seroprevalence in Healthcare Workers in Bukavu, Eastern Democratic Republic of Congo. Am J Trop Med Hyg [Internet]. 2021 Apr 7;104(4):1526–30. Available from: https://www.ajtmh.org/view/journals/tpmd/104/4/article-p1526.xml

Mullard A. How COVID vaccines are being divvied up around the world. Nature [Internet]. 2020 Nov 30; Available from: http://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-020-03370-6

Murillo-Zamora E, Trujillo X, Huerta M, Riós-Silva M, Mendoza-Cano O. Effectiveness of BNT162b2 COVID-19 Vaccine in Preventing Severe Symptomatic Infection among Healthcare Workers. Medicina (B Aires) [Internet]. 2021 Jul 23;57(8):746. Available from: https://www.mdpi.com/1648-9144/57/8/746

Nuclear Threat Initiative (NTI), Johns Hopkins Center for Health Security (JHU). GHS Index. 2020.

OWID. COVID-19 Data Explorer - Our World in Data. 2022.

Oxford COVID-19 Government Response Tracker. Calculation and presentation of the Stringency Index 4.0 28 April 2020 [Internet]. Oxford; 2020. Available from: https://www.bsg.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/Calculation and presentation of the Stringency Index.pdf

Petersen E, Ntoumi F, Hui DS, Abubakar A, Kramer LD, Obiero C, et al. Emergence of new SARS-CoV-2 Variant of Concern Omicron (B.1.1.529) - highlights Africa’s research capabilities, but exposes major knowledge gaps, inequities of vaccine distribution, inadequacies in global COVID-19 response and control efforts. Int J Infect Dis [Internet]. 2022 Jan;114:268–72. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S1201971221008882

R Core Team (2020). R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.

Roser M, Ritchie H, Ortiz-Ospina E, Hassell J. Excess mortality during the Coronavirus pandemic (COVID-19) - Our World in Data. OurWorldInData.org. 2020.

Samur AA, Coskunfirat N, Saka O. Comparison of predictor approaches for longitudinal binary outcomes: application to anesthesiology data. PeerJ. 2014;2(1).

The World Bank. GDP (current US$) | Data. The World Bank. 2018a.

The World Bank. Population ages 65 and above, total. World Bank Data. 2018b.

The World Bank. WGI 2019 Interactive. The World Bank. 2019. p. 1.

UK Health Security Agency. SARS-CoV-2 variants of concern and variants under investigation in England- Technical briefing: Update on hospitalisation and vaccine effectiveness for Omicron VOC-21NOV-01 (B.1.1.529) [Internet]. London; 2021. Available from: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/1044481/Technical-Briefing-31-Dec-2021-Omicron\_severity\_update.pdf

Vasileiou E, Simpson CR, Shi T, Kerr S, Agrawal U, Akbari A, et al. Interim findings from first-dose mass COVID-19 vaccination roll-out and COVID-19 hospital admissions in Scotland: a national prospective cohort study. Lancet [Internet]. 2021 May;397(10285):1646–57. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0140673621006772

Wang H, Paulson KR, Pease SA, Watson S, Comfort H, Zheng P, et al. Estimating excess mortality due to the COVID-19 pandemic: a systematic analysis of COVID-19-related mortality, 2020-21. Lancet (London, England). 2022 Apr;399(10334):1513–36.

Watson OJ, Barnsley G, Toor J, Hogan AB, Winskill P, Ghani AC. Global impact of the first year of COVID-19 vaccination: a mathematical modelling study. Lancet Infect Dis [Internet]. 2022 Jun;3099(22):1–10. Available from: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099(22)00320-6

Wei C, Shan KJ, Wang W, Zhang S, Huan Q, Qian W. Evidence for a mouse origin of the SARS-CoV-2 Omicron variant. J Genet Genomics [Internet]. 2021 Dec; Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S1673852721003738

WHO. Global health services data, obesity and overweight. 2020a.

WHO. Report of the WHO-China Joint Mission on Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) [Internet]. Geneva, Switzerland; 2020b. Available from: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/report-of-the-who-china-joint-mission-on-coronavirus-disease-2019-(covid-19)

WHO. Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) Weekly Epidemiological Update and Weekly Operational Update [Internet]. Geneva, Switzerland; 2022a. Available from: https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/situation-reports

WHO. Global excess deaths associated with the COVID-19 pandemic. 2022b.

World Data Bank. Population density (people per sq. km of land area). World Development Indecators. 2018.

Worldometer. Coronavirus Cases. Worldometer. 2020. p. 1–22.

Yue S, Pilon P. A comparison of the power of the t test, Mann-Kendall and bootstrap tests for trend detection / Une comparaison de la puissance des tests t de Student, de Mann-Kendall et du bootstrap pour la détection de tendance. Hydrol Sci J [Internet]. 2004 Feb 24;49(1):21–37. Available from: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1623/hysj.49.1.21.53996

Zhang J, Zhang Y, Kang JY, Chen S, He Y, Han B, et al. Potential transmission chains of variant B.1.1.7 and co-mutations of SARS-CoV-2. Cell Discov [Internet]. 2021 Dec 15;7(1):44. Available from: http://www.nature.com/articles/s41421-021-00282-1

Zhao S, Lou J, Cao L, Chong KC, Zee BCY, Chan PKS, et al. Differences in the case fatality risks associated with SARS-CoV-2 Delta and non-Delta variants in relation to vaccine coverage: An early ecological study in the United Kingdom. Infect Genet Evol [Internet]. 2022 Jan;97:105162. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S1567134821004627

**Acknowledgements**

NH, JG, FN, OD, RA AZ, RK are part of PANDORA-ID-NET Consortium (EDCTP Reg/Grant RIA2016E-1609) funded by the European and Developing Countries Clinical Trials Partnership (EDCTP2) programme, which is supported under Horizon 2020, the European Union's Framework Programme for Research and Innovation. NH, RA and JG are member of International Developmnet Research Centre, Canada’s grant on West African One Health Actions for understanding, preventing and mitigating outbreaks (109810). AZ is a National Institutes of Health Research senior investigator.

**Author contribution statement:** NH and RK originally planned the study, MNH collected the data, NH and MNH, MJU analyzed the data. NH prepared the first draft manuscript and MNH, JG, RAK, DM, FN, OD, RA, MJU, AZ and RK reviewed the draft manuscripts. All authors approved the submission of the manuscript.

**Conflict of interest:** The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest

**Funding Source:** There was no funding for this research.

**Ethical approval:** This study does not include any individual-level data and thus does not require any ethical approval.

**Data availability statement:** All the data presented in this manuscript are publicly available in “Our World in Data”, “WHO” or “United Nations” webpages. However, the corresponding author can be reached to specific queries on the data sources.

**Figure legends:**

**Fig 1:** The top-20 countries with COVID-19 vaccination rate (reported number of vaccine doses administered/100 people) and the reported case-fatality ratio due to COVID-19.

**Fig 2.** Top: Observed and predicted global daily reported Case-Fatality ratio (rCFR) using Simple Exponential Smoothing (SES) model. Middle: Observed and predicted daily worldwide daily cumulative rCFR using Auto-Regressive Integrated Moving Average (ARIMA) model. Bottom: Observed and predicted daily worldwide daily cumulative rCFR using Automatic Forecasting time-series model (Prophet model). The black dots indicate observed data, the blue line indicates the predictive CFR, and the shaded area indicates the 95% confidence interval of predicted CFR.

**Fig 3:** The map shows the COVID-19 vaccination rate (reported number of vaccine doses administered/100 people) and the reported Case-fatality ratio (rCFR) in different countries of the world on 10 May 2022. The darker colour indicates the higher vaccination rates or higher case-fatality ratios. An opposite correlation exists between COVID-19 vaccination rate and rCFR (r= -0.362, p<0.001) and excess mortality (-0.172 (P=0.034).

**Fig 4:** The density plot of observed reported case-fatality ratio (rCFR) and predicted rCFR of COVID-19 (left) and rCFR and Excess mortality (right).

**Tables:**

Table 1: The reported number of vaccine doses administered/100 people and reported case-fatality ratio (rCFR) of COVID-19 in the top-20 vaccinated countries and rest of the world during 5 Jan 2021 and 31 Aug 2022 (for excess mortality 29 Aug 2022).

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Top-20 countries with vaccination rates**  **Mean ± SE** | **Rest of the world including SSA**  **Mean ± SE** | **Global**  **Mean ± SE** | **Sub-Saharan Africa**  **Mean ± SE** |
| Vaccination  Doses/100 People  (31 Dec 2022) | 250.23 ± 12.79 | 194.84 ± 13.52 | 213.30 ± 11.08 | 51.21 ± 6.26 |
| Reported CFR by 5 Jan 2021 | 1.84 ± 0.39 | 2.34 ± 0.24 | 2.27 ± 0.21 | 1.97 ± 0.19 |
| Reported CFR by 31 December 2022 | 0.58 ± 0.12 | 1.72 ± 0.16 | 1.59 ± 0.14 | 1.82 ± 0.20 |
| Reported CFR dropped by (%) | 69.31 | 26.50 | 29.96 | 7.61 |
| p-value (for the differences of rCFR between 5 Jan 2021 and 31 December 2022) | 0.003 | 0.318 | 0.008 | 0.309 |
| Excess mortality (deaths/100,000) by 4 Jan 2021 | 0.37 ± 0.12 | 0.40 ± 0.05 | 0.39 ± 0.04 | 0.28 ± 0.07 |
| Excess mortality (deaths/100,000) by 30 Dec 2022 | 0.19 ± 0.03 | 0.15 ± 0.01 | 0.16 ± 0.01 | 0.11 ± 0.01 |
| Excess mortality dropped by (%) | 48.65 | 62.50 | 58.97 | 60.71 |
| p-value (for the differences of excess mortality between 4 Jan 2021 and 29 August 2022) | 0.207 | <0.001 | <0.001 | 0.022 |

**Table 2: Factors associated with reported Case-Fatality ratio (rCFR) of COVID-19 and excess mortality in different counties of the world using a generalized linear mixed model during 1 Jan 2020 and 31 Aug 2022.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variables** | **Reported case-fatality ratio (rCFR)** | | | **Excess mortality** | | |
| **Odds ratio (OR)** | **95% Confidence Interval** | **P-value** | **Odds ratio [OR]** | **95% Confidence Interval** | **P-value** |
| Vaccination | 0.636 | 0.620 - 0.652 | <0.001 \*\*\* | 0.960 | 0.943 - 0.977 | <0.001 \*\*\* |
| The percentage of people aged 65 and above | 1.189 | 1.020 - 1.387 | 0.027 \* | 1.164 | 1.117 - 1.212 | <0.001 \*\*\* |
| Population density | 0.878 | 0.652 - 1.182 | 0.390 | 0.994 | 0.918 - 1.076 | 0.877 |
| COVID-19 Tests/1000 | 0.849 | 0.829 - 0.868 | <0.001 \*\*\* | 1.013 | 1.002 - 1.023 | 0.015 \*\* |
| GDP | 0.787 | 0.682 - 0.908 | <0.001 \*\*\* | 0.923 | 0.889 - 0.959 | <0.001 \*\*\* |
| GHSI | 1.221 | 1.043 - 1.428 | 0.013 \* | 0.968 | 0.928 – 1.010 | 0.133 |
| WGI | 0.986 | 0.854 - 1.138 | 0.848 | 0.932 | 0.896 - 0.969 | <0.001 \*\*\* |
| Obesity (%) | 1.186 | 1.054 - 1.335 | 0.005 \*\* | 1.076 | 1.042 - 1.111 | <0.001 \*\*\* |
| Stringency index | 0.880 | 0.867 - 0.893 | <0.001 \*\*\* | 1.132 | 1.118 - 1.145 | <0.001 \*\*\* |
| Weeks | 1.100 | 1.044 - 1.158 | <0.001 \*\*\* | 1.156 | 1.124 - 1.187 | <0.001 \*\*\* |
| **Groups Name** | **Variance** | **Standard Deviation** |  | **Variance** | **Standard Deviation** |  |
| Location (Intercept) | 0.3103 | 0.5571 |  | 0.01998 | 0.1414 |  |
| Weeks (Intercept) | 0.0478 | 0.2186 |  | 0.01055 | 0.1027 |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Akaike information criterion (AIC)** | | -174928.6 | |  | -30707.5 | |
| **Bayesian Information Criterion (BIC)** | | -174826.5 | |  | -30605.3 | |
| **Root Mean Square Error (RMSE)** | | 0.0001 | |  | 0.062 | |
| **Conditional *R2*** | | 0.788 | |  | 0.513 | |
| **Marginal *R2*** | | 0.333 | |  | 0.217 | |
| **Intraclass correlation (ICC)** | | 0.682 | |  | 0.378 | |

**Table 3.** The summary of Simple Exponential Smoothing (SES), Auto-Regressive Integrated Moving Average (ARIMA), Automatic forecasting time-series model (Prophet), Mann-Kendall (M-K), trend and Sen’s slope analysis. The SES, ARIMA, and Prophet models used daily cumulative reported case-fatality ratio (rCFR) data.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Reported case-fatality ratio** | | | **Excess mortality** | | |
| **Method & Period** | ***R2*** | **RMSE** | **MAE** | ***R2*** | **RMSE** | **MAE** |
| ***Simple Exponential Smoothing*** | | | |  |  |  |
| Overall | 99.94% | 0.038 | 0.014 | 96.19% | 0.049 | 0.034 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ***Auto-Regressive Integrated Moving Average*** | | | |  |  |  |
| Overall ARIMA | 99.97% | 0.029 | 0.008 | 96.41% | 0.048 | 0.033 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ***Automatic Forecasting time-series model*** | | | |  |  |  |
| Overall | 99.50% | 0.113 | 0.059 | 75.11% | 0.126 | 0.102 |

**Fig 1:**



**Fig 2:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| **Reported Case-fatality ratio** | **Excess mortality** |

**Fig 3**



**Fig 4:**

|  |
| --- |
|  |